

NSW Govt Upper House Inquiry: Museums and Galleries, 2016

Agenda: 3.0 – 3.30 September 6, 2016

Submissions of specific relevance to the argument for not relocating the Powerhouse Museum.

These papers include support for developing a new cultural facility in Parramatta, within a strong policy for museums and galleries in NSW.

They were submitted by members of the informal lobby group, the Powerhouse Museum Alliance, with related submissions from external colleagues and organisations.

Links below refer directly to Parliament's website for this Inquiry.


1. Submissions: from the Powerhouse Museum Alliance

167: Powerhouse Museum Alliance: purpose and support

Background for this informal lobby group of professionals.

 [0167 Powerhouse Museum Alliance](#)

Nicholas Pappas

113. Abdication of statutory responsibilities by trustees and lack of inspection transparency in government processes.  [0113 Mr Nicholas Pappas](#)

Jennifer Sanders

142: Mythbusting: addressing the arguments to move the museum

142a: Costs and risks of moving the museum

142b: A cultural plan for the 21st century

142c: Moving Museums: a brief survey

142d: Planning for NSW's Cultural Development: a tale of two proposals

 [0142 Ms Jennifer Sanders](#);

 [0142a Ms Jennifer Sanders](#)

 [0142b Ms Jennifer Sanders](#)

 [0142c Ms Jennifer Sanders](#)

 [0142d Ms Jennifer Sanders](#)

Grace Cochran

96: Expectations of Audiences: constituents must be considered

96a: Sustainability? Appropriate investment for sites and programs


96b: For the Record: Briefing paper for Premier, August 2015

 [0096 Dr Grace Cochran](#)


 [0096a Dr Grace Cochran](#)

 [0096b Dr Grace Cochran](#)

Kylie Winkworth

149: Ten important issues regarding the proposed move of the Powerhouse Museum from Ultimo to Parramatta; and consideration of alternative strategies to support museum development.  [0149 Ms Kylie Winkworth](#)

Lindsay Sharp

148: I: The Powerhouse Museum to Parramatta 'move': a critical analysis of the NSW Government's planning and costing processes: **main source document.**  [0148 Dr Lindsay Sharp](#)

148a: II: The Powerhouse Museum to Parramatta 'move': a critical analysis of the NSW Government's suppressed planning and costing documentation...

 [0148a Dr Lindsay Sharp](#)


148b: III: A possible alternative focused on human creativity and the creativity of western Sydney's multi-cultural Communities...

 [0148b Dr Lindsay Sharp](#)

148c: IV: Widespread consultation required in the greater western Sydney region as to what kind of new cultural facility they wish to see established in Parramatta.


 [0148c Dr Lindsay Sharp](#)


148d: V: Site selection process in Parramatta.  [0148d Dr Lindsay Sharp](#)

148e: VI: Commercial aspects driving Ultimo site divestment/sale by Govt to facilitate the unaffordable, destructive and impractical concept of 'moving' the Powerhouse Museum to Parramatta.  [0148e Dr Lindsay Sharp](#)

148f: VII: Performance by Board of Trustees, dominance by Government, sub-optimal project oversight, potential conflicts of personal interest, reduced access and risks to collections, misleading messaging and lack of transparency. Decline of museum's educational role; senior management project competence, appropriate design and exhibit development abilities and internal curatorial skills base.

 [0148f Dr Lindsay Sharp](#)

148g: VIII: The new museum project in Western Australia – comparison with the 'Powerhouse Museum move' to Parramatta.  [0148g Dr Lindsay Sharp](#)


149h: IX: Committee of Review proposal; an appraisal of the 'Powerhouse Museum move' to Parramatta project in terms of consultation, location, planning process, cost and scale.  [0148h Dr Lindsay Sharp](#)

Trevor Kennedy

141: Plea to review decision, from PHM Life Fellow and benefactor.

 [0141 Mr Trevor Kennedy](#)

103 and 103a: Anne Schofield:

Comments from PHM Life Fellow, Honorary Associate and benefactor, on responses from donors and benefactors, criticism of funding cuts, consultation process and others.  [0103a Ms Anne Schofield](#)

Marco Belgiorno-Zegna AM

162: International comparisons with proposal and no successful examples; value in satellites; inconsistency with other cultural institutions; Government's unwillingness consider any improvement in accessing the Powerhouse site from the Haymarket/Darling Harbour side, including Light Rail access; '...nothing other than an attempt by the NSW Government to curry favour with the western Sydney electorate. In pursuing this strategy the Government is merely taking a short-term view that may be in its own interests and not those of the people of NSW.'

 [0162 Mr Marco Belgiorno-Zegna AM](#)

2.0 Related papers: Individuals who oppose the relocation and suggest better alternatives

Lionel Glendenning

155: Government cultural planning

155a: Powerhouse Museum: cultural investment

155b: Urban design and architecture


 [0155 Mr Lionel Glendenning](#)

 [0155a Mr Lionel Glendenning](#)

 [0155b Mr Lionel Glendenning](#)

158: Bernice Murphy

Questions significant presumptions, consequences, and shortfalls in both process and long-term outcomes; some irreversible consequences; alternative planning for direct access, stimulus and enrichment of communities radiating around Parramatta.

 [0158 Ms Bernice Murphy](#)

132: Des Griffin

Within broad policy discussion, includes: The proposal to move the Powerhouse Museum to the western suburbs, specifically Parramatta, is one of the most ridiculous proposals concerning cultural institutions in the history of this state. Its rationale and costing are more than seriously flawed, the promoted reasons and outcomes are laughable and the major considerations which the government has addressed have been concealed.

 [0132 Dr Desmond Griffin](#)

Christina Sumner

136: 1) Access to the collections; 2) The sale of the Powerhouse Museum site in Ultimo and its proposed move to Parramatta, and whether there are alternative strategies.


 [0136 Ms Christina Sumner OAM](#)


Debbie Rudder

143: **a.** Question costing process and conclusions for move; PHM needs new investment rather than costly move; better strategies for museum and gallery development on Western Sydney; **b.** Adequacy of funding support for collection-based museums, and transparency of advice; **c.** consider Castle Hill venue; impact of efficiency dividend on museum programs; value of web-site access.


 [0143 Ms Debbie Rudder](#)

Andrew Grant


105. To discredit the argument advanced by Infrastructure NSW that the current location of the Powerhouse Museum is "remote" and therefore unsuitable because it falls outside a proposed "Sydney CBD cultural precinct". It also expresses concern about apparent inconsistencies between the Government's previous and current policy on this matter and in the decision-making process.  [0105 Mr Andrew Grant](#)

105a. Loss of the current site of the Powerhouse Museum would be a great loss to Australia's cultural heritage.  [0105a Mr Andrew Grant](#)

135: Sandra McEwen

Mismanagement of public funds; inadequacy of proposed site; barrier to tourists; breakup of synergistic creative associations.  [0135 Ms Sandra McEwen](#)

121: Patricia Johnston


Opposition to sale and relocation of Powerhouse Museum; request for better alternatives for Parramatta.  [0121 Ms Patricia Johnson](#)

93: Belinda Nemec

Recommendation to reverse ill-thought out decision; relationship between the collections, exhibitions and programs of MAAS and the Ultimo site is extremely important; if moved to Parramatta, it will close entirely within twenty years, through lack of visitation and community support. Better options for Parramatta.

 [0093 Dr Belinda Nemec](#)

144: Louise Douglas

Absence of research and strategic analysis is perplexing; Western Sydney cultural facilities should be enhanced; not convinced that there is strong enough foundation for moving the Powerhouse to Parramatta, but support different solutions so the cultural facilities of Western Sydney can be enhanced.  [0144 Ms Louise Douglas](#)

153: Rosalind Ward

Alternative strategies; costs of moving; impact of efficiency dividend.

 [0153 Ms Rosalind Ward](#)

65: Terence Measham

Significance of both collection and buildings; need central location.

 [0065 Mr Terence Measham](#)

90. Shirley Fitzgerald

The future of the Powerhouse Museum, and access to its collections.

 [0090 Dr Shirley Fitzgerald](#)

119. Leo Schofield

A dozen cogent reasons as to why this proposal is not only misguided but also absurdly costly, in terms of both money and loss of prestige.

[No. 119, Leo Schofield](#)

Tom Lockley


137, a,b,c: Oppose the relocation; heritage value of buildings and large exhibits; and other issues such as costs, safety, place in Ultimo.

 [0137 Mr Tom Lockley](#)


 [137a Mr Tom Lockley](#)

 [0137b Mr Tom Lockley](#)

0015: Pyrmont History Group

For people of Ultimo and Pyrmont – and of the inner city as a whole – access to their own industrial and social heritage.  [0015 Pyrmont History Group](#)

0022: Ultimo Village Voice

Opposes the sale of the Powerhouse Museum in Ultimo and its relocation to Parramatta, while firmly supporting the establishment of new cultural facilities in Western Sydney.  [0022 Ultimo Village Voice](#)

169: Mrs E Bosel

Concern at inadequacy of site and safety of collection; the move will devalue potential for cultural tourism; no alternatives other than purchasing an adjacent building in Ultimo and curtail any plans to proceed with a move to Parramatta.

[!\[\]\(8af806fb1314382d09bc5ec5b767526c_img.jpg\)0169 Mrs E Boesel](#)

118: Darani Lewers

Serious flaws in proposal to relocate; consideration of alternative strategies.

[!\[\]\(e2376d476d06eb31946dc01a69a4403a_img.jpg\)0118 Mrs Darani Lewers](#)

139: Jane Burns

Oppose the move; questions of access, sale and transparency of process.

[!\[\]\(830769b31eeeaca920791081939ff8ba_img.jpg\)0139 Ms Jane Burns](#)

156: Charles Wilson

Concerned the proposed relocation to Parramatta will effectively kill off the Museum as a significant cultural institution; should stay in ...the tourism, creative and education precinct of Ultimo.. [!\[\]\(8bba887393ca45b761e5cb49e755e762_img.jpg\)0156 Mr Charles Wilson](#)

101: Janet De Boer

Access to collection from interstate; opposition to demolition of buildings; lack of adequate consultation re both Powerhouse and Parramatta. [!\[\]\(47734e4656765d20df4fdbd5b7aff048_img.jpg\)0101 Dr Janet De Boer](#)

104: Carl Andrew

Significance of collection; importance of central location. [!\[\]\(0fb13ad0bfa3d86868cdd3883e5665b3_img.jpg\)0104 Mr Carl Andrew](#)

120: Sue Boaden

Oppose total move; consider better options. [!\[\]\(41aea2746216b27a6939d696d8e035da_img.jpg\)0120 Sue Boaden Cultural Planner](#)

97: Marina Garlick

Danger that we will lose the Powerhouse and western Sydney will get a substandard facility. Other options better for Parramatta. [!\[\]\(e50091943b385fe16d3277389202856f_img.jpg\)0097 Ms Marina Garlick](#)

122: Tim McDonald

Oppose move: proposal appears arbitrary, lacks context, appears to be policy making on the run, politically motivated rather than a considered response to process and fails to respond to identified needs of the community. [!\[\]\(179f167ede0522ebb4ea025b3ad78ca7_img.jpg\)0122 Mr Tim McDonald](#)

128: Irma Havlicek

To protect the Powerhouse Museum and its outstanding collection, is to leave it where it is; resource it adequately where it is, so that it can do its vital job of educating and enlightening visitors...; build a brilliant museum in Parramatta, and lend objects to it from all of Sydney's state museums. [!\[\]\(e119fc79c8f448683d20ba4c873025a2_img.jpg\)0128 Ms Irma Havlicek](#)

78: Garry Horvai

Criticism of government decision and process in the face of existing Powerhouse strategic plan; opposition to proposed move. [!\[\]\(5ddb2a112276baa148775929432349f9_img.jpg\)0078 Mr Garry Horvai](#)

157: John Petersen

Closure of Powerhouse Museum's Migration Heritage Centre as a consequence of efficiency dividends and budget cuts, is an example of high level of inequity in arts and cultural funding for ethnic communities and rural and regional areas of NSW.

[!\[\]\(008bfeb2de157dcb66edb3a8218c280e_img.jpg\)0157 Mr John Petersen](#)

5: Tor Larsen

Observations on audiences for both the Powerhouse in Ultimo, and for Parramatta; lack of transparency in planning. [📄0005 Tor Larsen](#)

82: Rebecca Spindler

Opposition to move of Powerhouse; government has a visibly, very poor record of community consultation; move is symbolic of the Baird government consistently placing the desires of big business over the needs of its citizens. Better opportunities for Parramatta. [📄0082 Dr Rebecca Spindler](#)

12: Jesse Adams Stein

Powerhouse Museum to be retained at its existing location in Ultimo: Cost, Community, Heritage and architecture, urban amenity, linkages with educational institutions. [📄0012 Jesse Adams Stein](#)

19: Robert Jeffrey Mellifont

Oppose moving Powerhouse from harbourside where it is part of an existing cultural and heritage precinct for existing and growing audiences. [📄0019 Mr Jeffrey Mellefont](#)

112: Ms Jeanie Kitchener:

Feels strongly about maintaining the Powerhouse museum on its current site; where museum designed around the original power station. [📄0112 Ms Jeanie Kitchener](#)

106: John August

Oppose the sale and total relocation; look at better options. [📄0106 Mr John August](#)

133. Dr Megan Hicks

Consideration of new museum in Parramatta and maintaining site in Ultimo. [📄0133 Dr Megan Hicks](#)

149 b-f: Kylie Winkworth: (extra papers re NSW museum policies)

- Potential funding impacts on museums and galleries affected by council amalgamations. [📄0149a Ms Kylie Winkworth](#)
- NSW government policy funding and support for museums and galleries; & opportunities to revitalise the structure, reach and impact of museums in regional NSW. [📄0149b Ms Kylie Winkworth](#)
- NSW government policy; Opportunities to revitalise the structure, reach and impact of museums; Impact of the efficiency dividend; Development and transparency of advice. [📄0149c Ms Kylie Winkworth](#)
- Access to the collections of NSW government museums. [📄0149d Ms Kylie Winkworth](#)
- The economic impact of museums and galleries on cultural tourism; Sydney and regional NSW. [📄0149e Ms Kylie Winkworth](#)

3.0 Related papers: Institutions that oppose the relocation and suggest better alternatives (among others)

21. Save the Powerhouse campaign

[📄0021 Save the Powerhouse Campaign](#)

15. Pyrmont History Group

[📄0015 Pyrmont History Group](#)

40. The Design Institute of Australia

[📄0040 The Design Institute of Australia](#)

44. 44a. North Parramatta Residents Action Group

- [!\[\]\(fd4127b9e2af37bd6ea0fa06afa8e6d8_img.jpg\) 0044 North Parramatta Residents Action Group Inc](#)
[!\[\]\(3278d6283d12f18012b5aa7d40747611_img.jpg\) 0044a North Parramatta Residents Action Group Inc](#)
- 61. Professional Historians Association of NSW**
[!\[\]\(bb96b32142ec45f72f12316beae3ef61_img.jpg\) 0061 Professional Historians Association NSW and ACT](#)
- 50. Australian Institute for the Conservation of Cultural Materials**
[!\[\]\(a75d0d7d1ac0ea815a0c027a77b137d5_img.jpg\) 0050 Australian Institute for the Conservation of Cultural Materials](#)
- 22. Ultimo Village Voice**
[!\[\]\(adab168ecea4e2ae40993afba3fcd26e_img.jpg\) 0022 Ultimo Village Voice](#)
- 29. Blue Mountains Cultural Centre - Blue Mountains City Council**
[!\[\]\(e95ea1a0e297340f96c3d715d76d8c23_img.jpg\) 0029 Blue Mountains Cultural Centre - Blue Mountains City Council](#)
- 51. NAVA: National Association of Visual Arts**
[!\[\]\(0e0cdd76cf8fb3c858658faf72d7f324_img.jpg\) 0051 National Association for the Visual Arts](#)
- 42. Museums Galleries Australia**
[!\[\]\(c7bdebfc2a52eab4f6683b0c1c0c28d2_img.jpg\) 0042 Museums Galleries Australia](#)
- 60. The Australian Ceramics Association**
[!\[\]\(8a5c092736ceaf7cfeed23b17ea5e6ff_img.jpg\) 0060 The Australian Ceramics Association](#)
- 46. The National Trust of Australia**
[!\[\]\(dd896e8effa212be4a7431ac3e5bf510_img.jpg\) 0046 National Trust of Australia](#)
- 131. Oriental Rug Society**
[!\[\]\(1136f3a14b3ba5842784adf33e611db1_img.jpg\) 0131 Oriental Rug Society of NSW](#)
- 166. Australian Society for History of Engineering and Technology Inc. (ASHET)** [!\[\]\(d536ae100fbef949d5488b8fe23458f5_img.jpg\) 0166 Australian Society for History of Engineering and Technology Inc](#)
- 159. Australian International Council on Monuments and Sites**
[!\[\]\(ca07eb06779edef206c13bdfc2c41b40_img.jpg\) 0159 Australia International Council on Monuments and Sites](#)
- 108. Engineers Australia**
[!\[\]\(7e7914364faa22e4d6649c877c7e723a_img.jpg\) 0108 Engineers Australia](#)
- 27. Engineers Australia NSW Division - Engineering Heritage Sydney**
[!\[\]\(8ca478e471a5a40f192eb324324796da_img.jpg\) 0027 Engineers Australia NSW Division - Engineering Heritage Sydney](#)
- 30. Greater Western Sydney Action Heritage Group**
[!\[\]\(1ef1c1e934c0d3468708b1b65c673a8e_img.jpg\) 0030 Greater Western Sydney Heritage Action Group](#)